Ethics Framework development in the South East CCAC

Building ethics capacity from front-line to boardroom

Carol Ravnaas, South East CCAC
Dr. Jennifer Gibson, University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics
Dr. Jonathan Breslin, South East CCAC
Imagine you are Manager of Client Services. Today you received a call from a Care Coordinator with the following challenge:

“Mrs. Lavine is an 84 y/o French speaking woman who has been receiving home care services after her recent hospitalization. The hospital team thought she needed long term care but her husband of sixty years insisted he would take care of her. Lately, however, he has been interfering with her care, refusing certain interventions and occasionally turning service providers away at the door. What should I do?”

What would you recommend?
Imagine you are on the Senior Management Team (SMT) of ABC Do Good organization.

This year, the organization anticipates a ten million dollar shortfall. As a result, the Board and SMT must make decisions about how it will balance its budget.

Any decision made will affect the lives of clients, caregivers, partners and staff.

- How do you decide what services to cut?
- What factors should influence these decisions?
Every day in health care...

Front line workers, Service Providers, CCAC leaders and Boards of Directors are challenged to consider the impact of decisions they make on the lives of clients and their families...and are left trying to answer tough questions...

- What is the *right thing to do* for clients and their families?
- Where should resources be used and on whom?
- How should we decide?
virtue, rights, compliance, ethics, relativism, law, opinion, duty, morality, obligation, values, responsibility, judgment, principles, consequences, interests, dilemma, right, standards
“Our population is aging, our health system is complex, the demands on the system are greater and the public’s expectations of what the health system can do for them are growing. It is more important than ever that we ensure good stewardship of public resources with organizational decision-making that is driven by ethical principles.”

Valerie Jackson,
South East CCAC Board Chair
May 2011
At the South East CCAC

- Tough choices are our past, present and future

- We knew we needed a new way to look at decisions, from front-line to board room

- We needed something to guide through the maze of competing priorities, values and choices
Our Ethics Journey began in 2010, when we committed to developing a comprehensive Ethics Framework and engaged the University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics to help us.
What is an Ethics Framework?

“Provides a standardized approach to working through ethics issues and making decisions”

- Accreditation Canada, Governance and Leadership Guidelines G1.3 & LD 1.4
• Big-E Ethics Framework:
  – “Ethics Program”

• Little-e Ethics Framework:
  – “Ethical Decision-making Tool”
Committing to a “Big-E” Ethics Framework

How an organization...

“defines its core values & mission, identifies areas in which important values come into conflict, seeks the best possible resolution of these conflicts, and manages its own performance to ensure that it acts in accord with espoused values”

Key Success Factors

**Integration**
- Bedside-to-boardroom (“system”)
- Network of ethics champions & expertise

**Sustainability**
- Clear goals & priorities (“strategic”)
- Good dose of prevention – capacity-building
- Dedicated resources

**Accountability**
- Formal lines of authority/accountability
- Action plans with evaluation strategy
South East Ethics Framework Project

Our overall goal:

To develop a *balanced* Ethics Framework that is integrated, sustainable, & accountable
## South East Ethics Framework Project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Ethics Strategic Planning</th>
<th>2. Ethics Program &amp; Service Development</th>
<th>3. Ethics Core Training &amp; Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal:</strong> To develop a vision &amp; priorities for the Ethics Framework</td>
<td><strong>Goal:</strong> To develop &amp; implement the Ethics Framework</td>
<td><strong>Goal:</strong> To build ethics capacity among leaders and staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>◆ Current State Review</td>
<td>◆ Operational Plan</td>
<td>◆ Ethics education sessions for board &amp; staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>◆ Ethics Program Implementation Plan</td>
<td>◆ Ethics Team</td>
<td>◆ Core training of Ethics Team members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>◆ Ethics Program Planning Workshop</td>
<td>◆ Ethical Decision-making Tools</td>
<td>◆ Ongoing coaching of Ethics Team</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Feb 2011 **→** Oct 2012
Phase 1: Ethics Strategic Planning

1. Current State Review
   - Ethics Needs Assessment
     - On line survey with input from 241 of 300 staff
     - Focus groups: staff (10) + external stakeholders (5)
   - Policy Compliance Review

2. Ethics Framework Planning Workshop
   - ~ 50 participants: Board of Directors, Senior Leadership, staff, community partners and networks
   - Three year vision, priorities, and action plan
The South East Ethical Framework

**Workplace**
Creating a supportive and healthy work environment that enables staff to meet their obligations, reach their potential, and provide seamless care

**Client Care**
Treating clients with respect, honesty, compassion and fairness in the context of their individual needs and circumstances

**Research**
Advancing continuous learning through research that is safe, accountable, and just, and protects the welfare of individual research subjects

**Governance / Management**
Ensuring accountability for stewardship of public resources and ethical decision-making in the organization to provide *outstanding care for every person, every day.*
Phase 2: Ethics Program and Service Development

1. Operational Planning

2. Ethics Team Development
   - Senior Leader
   - Ethicist
   - Ethics Facilitators
   - Ethics Forum

3. Ethical Decision-making Frameworks/Tools
Priority Areas for Action

- Creating Conditions for the Ethics Framework to Succeed**
- Aligning With Partners to Advance Ethics Regional
- Providing Education and Capacity-building**
- Engaging Clients
- Evaluating Ethics Framework Impact
- Embedding Ethics in Policies
# Ethics Roadmap

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage 1: Emerging</th>
<th>Stage 2: Achieving</th>
<th>Stage 3: Excelling</th>
<th>Stage 4: Leading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Need for formal ethics framework recognized at senior management/board level</td>
<td>• Ethics framework defined and aligned with strategic directions</td>
<td>• Ethics framework evident in daily practice, and embedded in strategic directions</td>
<td>• Ethics framework inherent in organizational practices/culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ethical issues and needs being identified</td>
<td>• Ethical issues and needs identified with some being addressed</td>
<td>• Ethical issues and needs identified with most being addressed proactively</td>
<td>• Setting the agenda for addressing ethical issues at a system level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Compliance with accreditation and other standards evolving</td>
<td>• Accreditation and other standards met in some areas and being developed in others</td>
<td>• Accreditation and other standards met in all areas and exceeded in some</td>
<td>• Setting industry standards/benchmarks for ethics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• No ethics infrastructure in place</td>
<td>• Ethics infrastructure in development, but not fully implemented or sustainable</td>
<td>• Ethics infrastructure fully developed and supported by sustainable resources</td>
<td>• Ethics infrastructure generating some revenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ethics integration primarily at the front line and/or in discrete locations</td>
<td>• Ethics integration across the organization (front-line to boardroom)</td>
<td>• Ethics integration extending to partners within local system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Early adopter of leading practices as an organization or in local or regional partnership</td>
<td>• Generating leading practices and contributing to the field through research and/or education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Recognized as a leader locally and provincially by peers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Integration
Sustainability
Accountability
Strategic Alignment
Impact
## Implementation Options

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Stage 1: Emerging</th>
<th>Stage 2: Achieving</th>
<th>Stage 3: Excelling</th>
<th>Stage 4: Leading</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clinical</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:**
- Integration
- Sustainability
- Accountability
- Strategic Alignment
- Impact
Operational Model
Operational Milestones & Investments

Figure 1. Key Milestones to Achieving & Excelling
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethics Team</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Director</td>
<td>Accountability; core leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethicist</td>
<td>Ethics expertise; core leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Facilitators</td>
<td>Ethics integration; local point-persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Forum</td>
<td>Monitoring and evaluation; planning &amp; policy development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics Facilitators

Both Client & Corporate Service staff

Process:
• Call for interest/nomination, interviews, orientation, confirmation of manager support

Selection criteria:
  ➢ Attributes – ‘go to’ person, trusted, good listener
  ➢ Geographic and programme distribution
Ethical decision-making tools

Difficult Cases (IDEA)

Organizational Decisions (A4R)

**Step 1: Identify the Facts - 4 Box Method**

**Medical Indications:**
- Ethical decisions that involve medical, professional, and economic needs of the organization.

**Client Preferences:**
- Identify client preferences. Do they have the capacity to decide? Are they competent? Are they capable of making a reasonable decision? What are their preferences? Is there a legal decision being proposed?

**Quality of Life:**
- Identify the quality of life the client has, client's preference to continue, and the impact of the decision on the client's quality of life.

**Contextual Feature:**
- Are there any specific contextual factors that need to be considered when making the decision? Are there any legal, ethical, or social implications?

PUBLICITY

REVISION

FAIR

PROCESSES

RELEVANCE

EMPOWERMENT

ENFORCEMENT
Phase 3. Ethics Core Training and Education

1. Core Ethics Training: Ethics Team
   - Modular format over 6 months: e.g., ethics awareness, ethical reasoning, ethical decision-making, facilitation skills

2. Ethics Education Sessions: Board & Staff
   - Board: Ethics & good governance; Priority setting and resource allocation
   - Staff: Ethics Awareness, Ethical Decision-making, Informed Consent
Our journey continues…

next steps

- Transition from JCB to ethicist in Nov 2012
- Focus on work required to implement the framework
1. Continue building Ethics Team skills and capacity
2. Develop ethics competence of staff and Board members
3. Provide SE CCAC with tools and processes for resolving ethical issues
4. Lead the development of a values-based culture at SE CCAC
5. Integrate ethical principles into budgeting process
Ethicist’s reflections

• Ethics Team
  – Importance of having the right people for the job

• Frameworks and tools
  – Cutting through the confusion
  – Development is only the first step
Ethicist’s reflections

- Ethics education
  - Developing ethics capacity/competence is a journey
  - Ethics isn’t just about the hard cases

- Being a “good person” isn’t enough
  - Blind spots and other barriers to ethical action
Has ethics made a difference at the South East CCAC?

✓ “Helped us to make difficult decisions with appropriate rationale that we can defend and feel ok about”

✓ Allows identification of ethical dilemmas and need for education sessions and / or policy revision

✓ Allows discussion of the issues with the team, the organization, and with colleagues

✓ Promotes communication / improved tolerance amongst colleagues and teams
“Helped with the sustainability challenge. Jonathan has helped us to consider questions from a different point of view & broadened our scope of considerations.”

Improves moral within teams as there is a sense of increased support. Someone/team to go to when the issue is convoluted/complex

Helped to have the courage to stand up and identify an ethical issue and request involvement from the organization
“It’s a breath of fresh air in very challenging times. The decisions still aren’t easy but the conversation seems more mature and thorough in nature”
Hopes for the Future

Continued implementation

Increased confidence

Ethics in day to day practice

Positive impact on patients/families

Increased dialogue

Improved appreciation of ethics

Support for each other
Key lessons

• Developing an ethics presence and approach is a journey requiring commitment, particularly at the board and senior levels.

• It is challenging to do broad education given various knowledge levels, consider grouping like needs or departments for education.

• Ethics requires openness and an explorative spirit.
More than ever, today’s health care decisions are tough…

Be it the board room or the front line case scenario

Viewing these situations through an ethical lens and applying principled based decision making leads to decisions that are

• Considerate
• Defensible
• Balanced
Acknowledgments

• South East CCAC Board & Senior Team, Ethics Facilitators and Staff

• JCB Consultation Team
  – Hannah Kaufman, Karen Faith, Shawn Winsor

• JCB Advisory Committee:
  – Frank Wagner, TCCCAC
  – Dianne Godkin, Trillium Health Partners
It's QUESTION TIME!!